

HOMAGE TO LILLIAN B. LAWLER  
WITH A SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY OF HER WRITINGS  
ON DANCE AND AN ADDENDA

In 1964 Lillian B. Lawler, Visiting Professor of Classics at the University of Iowa, had published in Iowa and in London respectively, two books which appear to have been the culmination of her major writings on dance. They are The Dance of the Ancient Greek Theatre and The Dance in Ancient Greece.<sup>1</sup> Throughout the almost three decades since their release, these publications have held a place in their field of scholarship which is pre-eminent.

In these two works and in Lawler's other two major writings on ancient Greek dance -- "The Dance in Ancient Crete" and "Terpsichore"<sup>2</sup> -- she refers to many of her journal articles. In all, forty-one such articles are quoted. These, along with her major writings, constitute a corpus of research on ancient Greek dance which is invaluable. For scholars of the ancient Greek world and for dancers curious about their profession's past, I present a list of these writings in the Select Bibliography.

Lillian Bray Lawler graduated from the University of Pittsburgh. She subsequently received her M.A. and Ph.D. at the University of Iowa. Her publishing career was heralded in 1927 by "The Easter Dances at Megara"<sup>3</sup> and by the canonical "The Maenads: A Contribution to the Study of the Dance in Ancient Greece."<sup>4</sup> The latter has forty-four pages of copiously footnoted text and ten plates giving forty-one illustrations. For advice and assistance with its preparation, the young Lillian offered special thanks to Professor Berthold Louis Ullman.

"The Maenads" appeared as part of the Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome VI and has been one of Lawler's most referred to texts. Indeed, it has at times been the only work accredited to Lawler even after other major and more mature treatises appeared -- such as "The Dance in Ancient Crete" of 1951.<sup>5</sup> It is understandable that "The Maenads" created an impact in dance and in classical studies circles of its day as it began with a highly critical assessment of "interpretations of the Greek dance up to the present time ..." Not only did Isadora Duncan, Maude Allen and the Denishawns, who were cult figures of the contemporary dance world, meet with young Lillian's disapproval for their lack of attention to archaeological and literary sources in their avowed aim to restore in visible form the spirit of Greek dance,<sup>6</sup> but she also castigates dance lexicographers for uncritical and inadequate coverages of the subject<sup>7</sup> and archaeologists for their "obvious lack of familiarity with the technique of dancing."<sup>8</sup>

Maurice Emmanuel, author of the esteemed Essai sur l'Orchestique Grecque (Paris, 1895), however, is warmly praised for his use of archaeological method and his technical knowledge which supports his attempts "to restore the technical details of several Greek dances."<sup>9</sup> Then Lawler censures Emmanuel for his theory of analogies between ancient Greek dance and traditional ballet.<sup>10</sup> The uncritical acceptance of this theory by lexicographers and writers on Greek dance is likewise deplored by Lawler. She notes that "the latest book on the dance in ancient art, Weege's Der Tans in der Antike, 1926"<sup>11</sup> "takes Emmanuel's conclusions as self-evident"; and she adds, despairingly, "not a step forward in thirty-one years!"<sup>12</sup>

Emmanuel and Weege were revered European classicists. To write critically in 1927 of their publications when one was young, American, and might I add, female, was no doubt considered hubris in the extreme.

In "The Maenads" Lawler gives a perceptive analysis of the various styles of Greek dance and she notes some iconographic and ethnographic pitfalls to be avoided in the study of dance.<sup>13</sup> Its fort  is its thorough coverage of every aspect of Maenad dress and movement. Lawler advises that only "sure representations of the several known dances in the best period of the dance" should be used for study, and elaborates with "for this paper only the Maenad dances as represented in the best period was studied ... in the case of vases, only red-figured ware was considered and preferably that of Attica."<sup>14</sup>

While there is evidence that the earlier more stylized Archaic and black-figure art may have been less accurate in its depiction of dance, as it was also of musical instruments,<sup>15</sup> one senses in the words "the best period" and "preferably that of Attica" the influence on Lawler of the older Classics teaching, according to which the Greeks progressed from the Dark Ages of the late 2nd millennium B.C.,<sup>16</sup> through the Geometric and Archaic periods, to a pinnacle of achievement in the so-called Classical period, at Athens, in the fifth century B.C. This is a viewpoint still held today, by some; but Lawler can be seen to have outgrown it by 1939, when she wrote 'The Dance of the Owl'.<sup>17</sup> Thereafter she treated all periods and realms of dance study with equal interest and pleasure.

The youthful enthusiasm of 'The Maenads' is a delight. It must have burst forth on the world of ancient Greek studies like a flower or a bombshell, depending upon one's views.

After 'The Maenads,' eleven years seemingly elapsed before the next Lawler publication. Was it, one may ask, during this period that Lawler published most of the fifty or so articles to which she does not refer in her final writings? This corpus of missing articles is suggested by the lacuna between those listed

in the Select Bibliography and Addenda and the "some 100 articles" accredited to Lawler in the Introduction to 'Terpsichore;' in Dance Perspectives 13 of Winter, 1962.<sup>18</sup>

It is pertinent to recall that for dance researchers, a comprehensive Dance Index of publications was absent from the first half of this century. Even the listing of Greek dance articles in the reputedly exhaustive L'Annee philologique - Bibliographie classique (Paris, 1928) is spasmodic, as if Choregraphie were an ephemeral, not quite respectable study. Indeed, many of Lawler's publications do not appear in it even when non-dance articles from the same journals are listed; Volume XVI for 1942-1944 is one example of this.

Did Lawler have to weather a storm of debate about her refutation of the Emmanuel theory about ancient Greeks doing the fouette, the glisse, the jete, the assemble and the changement? If so, she may have opted for a publication silence for a decade.

Certainly it is a less youthful but no less challenging writer that re-emerges with 'Lucida Veste' in 1938. The ethno-choreological approach hinted at in Lawler's 1927 comparison of Maenad's dance with the "simplicity" of "Greek peasants' dance"<sup>20</sup> is further developed in 1940 in 'The dance of the Κινακίδες - the Clappers. In it, Lawler's broad anthropological sweep of comparisons, from the Andamans, Ceram, the Celebes and Solomon Islands to Hawaii and elsewhere<sup>21</sup> must have stunned, indeed shocked, those classicists who felt there could be no similarity between the ancient Greeks and such peoples, even in the realm of dance.

From 1940 onwards, notes and articles by Lawler appear usually at least twice each year. They range in length from the few illuminating paragraphs of 'A "Mortar" Dance' to the eighteen pages of 'The Geranos Dance - a new Interpretation'.<sup>22</sup> Fresh, definitive and thoroughly researched, the articles display a remarkable clarity.

'A Dancer's Trophy' sweeps the reader along with its brisk pace. Every sentence is significant in the two pages that it takes to put the case convincingly for the Cipyron cemetery wine jug, found in 1971. That "the oldest Attic inscription discovered in modern times," had to be recognised as a dancer's trophy is also significant.<sup>23</sup>

Not only did Lillian B. Lawler look at the ancient Greek world of dance as a trained dancer but also as a superb scholar. One shares her satisfaction in discovery and relishes her warm humour.

There are some minor matters with which present day dance scholars may find themselves at variance with Lawler -- such as

the idea that animals 'dance'. But then, as an anthropologist, Lawler had to look at the ancient Greek world through ancient Greek eyes; and they saw animals as dancing, so she must too. Also, more iconographic illustrations with the texts of her articles would assist. Illustrations are amply provided in all the larger works except 'The Dance of the Ancient Greek Theatre' but are missing from most smaller ones. Perhaps the swiftness with which Lawler chose to pen and publish precluded her requesting and receiving photographic material.

Were she writing today, Lawler would possibly respond differently to the hip-rotating dances she referred to, with mild disdain, in 'A "Mortar" Dance' and in 'Ladles, Tubs and the Greek Dance'.<sup>24</sup> She may see them now as cosmic, fertility dances originally performed by women in cult ceremonies. The later burlesquing of their schemata in the comic male dances, which Lawler describes, may indeed have been thought to have the same propitious ritual effect.

It is satisfying to note that Lawler was for some time a travelling lecturer on Greek dance for the Archaeological Institute of America. She was on the faculty of Hunter College for many years and was editor-in-chief of Classical Outlook for twenty-one years. She became Vice President of the American Classical League, President of the Classical Association of the Atlantic States and a Fellow of the American Academy in Rome.<sup>25</sup>

When Lawler retired in 1964, she was, as her esteemed compatriot in the field of Classics, Margarete Bieber, has said, "in the full bloom of her creative years."<sup>26</sup>

From Australia, I offer homage to a scholar whose thinking was in advance of her times, who sprang constant surprises on the academic world and who left a valuable legacy in her writings. About dancers and the dance, she wrote as an insider. It is to be hoped that there may be new editions of Lawler's 1964 publications to celebrate their thirtieth anniversary, and that someone close to the necessary sources may produce a biography and a complete bibliography of this truly distinguished doyen of ancient Greek dance.

Patricia W. Rovik

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

To Dr. Graham Pont (University of New South Wales) who introduced me to the writings of Lillian B. Lawler; to Dr. Drid Williams (University of Sydney and now Moi University, Kenya) who shared my enthusiasm for Lillian B.; and to Visiting Professor David Konstan (from Brown University) who arranged for despatch to me of the Classic Outlook articles unavailable in Australia, I offer my warmest thanks.

## NOTES

All Select Bibliography entries are referred to in the Notes by number only.

1. 44 and 45.
2. 38 and 43. 'Terpsichore' is reviewed by Francis D. Lazenby in CJ 59 (1963) 36-37. He corrects, at Lawler's request, a few publication errors in the text.  
  
Reviews of Lawler 1964 appear in Gnomon XXXVII 1965:617-618, Korzeniewski; CR XV 1965:365, Boardman; CW LVIII 1965:278, Feaver; AJA LXX 1966:78-80, Bieber; Archaeology XIX 1966:225, Laban; and CJ LXI 1966:369, Lazenby.
3. CJ XXIII 7-15.
4. 1.
5. 38. See Michelangelo Cagliano de Azevedo in Encyclopedia of World Art Volume III Rome 1960 'Choreography - The Ancient World': Bibliography 1899-1959, Pp586-587.
6. 1:69.
7. 1:69-70.
8. 1:70.
9. Ibid.
10. 1:70-73.
11. Weege (Halle 1926)
12. 1:70.
13. 1:73-76.
14. 1:73 and 76.
15. Helen Roberts: 'Reconstructing the Greek tortoise-shell lyre' in Archaeology and Musical Instruments (World Archaeology 12/3, 1981). Pages 44-45 and 52-53 compares black-figure and red-figure vase painters for accuracy in depicting playing techniques for the lyre. "Black-figure artists had not yet mastered the portrayal of the human anatomy ... with the consequence that their figures seem stiff and inflexible, like dummies draped in human costume." The "considerably more advanced" (sic) technique of the fifth-century red-figure artists was undoubtedly of greater use to Roberts and, initially, to Lawler.

164.

16. A.M. Snodgrass: The Dark Age of Greece (Edinburgh, 1971) Chapter I, passim.
17. 3:489-492.
18. 43:2.
19. The debate continued with Louis Sechan's, La dance grecque antique (Paris, 1930) and Germain Prudhommeau's, La dance Grecque antique (Paris, 1965) supporting the Emmanuel premise. Other writers, including T.B.L. Webster's, The Greek Chorus (London, 1970:xi) supported Lawler.
20. 1:76.
21. 4:231.
22. 27:34 and 24:112-130.
23. 29 and at end of Addenda.
24. 27 and 34.
25. 32:110 and 43:2.
26. AJA LXX (1966:78). This review of Lawler's two 1964 publications and Lawler's response (ibid 288) are of considerable interest. Margarete Bieber's criticism of Lawler for their lack of archaeological references is not upheld by Webster (1970:xi). He is, however, troubled by what he perceives as Lawler's lack of attention to metre. In this he compares her unfavorably with A.M. Dale, his wife (ibid xiii). Nevertheless, Webster admits that he has "learnt much from Miss Lawler's many papers"; and the final sentence of Bieber's mostly appreciative review of Lawler's two 1964 publications is, "They are mature works of a lifelong special study of the dance."

In the Membership Lists of the American Philological Association, after a few years of Lawler being entered as "Professor Emeritus," note was taken at last of her gender and in 1968 she was designated as "Professor Emerita."

LILLIAN B. LAWLER  
A Select Bibliography

AJA	American Journal of Archaeology
AJP	American Journal of Philology
CB	Classical Bulletin
CJ	Classical Journal
CO	Classical Outlook
CP	Classical Philology
CW	Classical Weekly
TAPA	Transactions of the American Philological Association

1. Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome, Volume VI 1927, 69-112, Plates 13-22. The Maenads.
2. TAPA 69 (1938) 423-438. Lucida Veste.
3. TAPA 70 (1939) 482-502. The Dance of the Owl and its Significance in the History of Greek Religion and the Drama.
4. TAPA 71 (1940) 230-238. The Dance of the *Τίτακίδες*.
5. AJA 44 (1940) 105-107. The Dancing Figures from Palaikastro - a New Interpretation.
6. CO 18 (1941) 69-71. The Dance of the Alphabet.
7. CP 36 (1941) 142-155. *ΙΧΘΥΕΣ ΧΟΡΕΥΤΑΙ*
8. CJ 37 (1941-1942) 94-96. Blinding Radiance and the Greek Dance.
9. CJ 37 (1941-1942) 351-361. The Dance of the Holy Birds.
10. CO 19 (1942) 58-60. "Flat Hand" in the Greek Dance.
11. CJ 38 (1942) 161-163. Dancing with the Elbows.
12. TAPA 73 (1942) 58-63. Four Dancers in the Birds of Aristophanes.
13. CO 20 (1943) 70-72. "A Snub-Nosed Hand" in the Greek Dance.
14. TAPA 74 (1943) 60-71. *\*Ὀρχήσις Ἰωνικῆ*.
15. CW 36 (1943) 116-117. Proteus is a Dancer.
16. CO 21 (1944) 59-61. Beating Motifs in the Greek Dance.
17. TAPA 75 (1944) 20-23. The Dance of the Ancient Mariners.

18. AJP 65 (1944) 75-80. "The Lily" in the Dance.
19. TAPA 76 (1945) 59-73. Διπλῆ, διπλοδία, διπλοδιεργός in the Greek Dance.
20. CP 40 (1945) 98-107. The "Thracian Pig Dance" (with Alice E. Kober)
21. CO 22 (1945) 59-61. The Messenger's Dance.
22. CJ 41 (1946) 241-247. Portrait of a Dancer.
23. AJP 67 (1946) 67-70. ΟΡΧΗΣΙΣ ΦΟΒΕΡΑ.
24. TAPA 77 (1946) 112-130. The Geranos Dance - A New Interpretation.
25. CP 41 (1946) 155-159. Pindar and Some Animal Dances.
26. CO 24 (1947) 38-39. Dance Mania in Prehistoric Greece.
27. CJ 43 (1947) 34. A "Mortar" Dance.
28. TAPA 78 (1947) 88-98. A Lion Among Ladies (Theocritus II, 66-68).
29. CW 41 (1947) 50-52. A Dancer's Trophy.
30. TAPA 79. (1948) 252-267. Orchesis Kallinikos.
31. CW 42 (1948) 2-6. A Necklace for Eileithyia.
32. Archaeology 1 (1948) 110-113. Snake Dances.
33. TAPA 80 (1949) 230-237. Airein Maschalen and Associated Orchestic Schēmata.
34. AJP 71 (1950) 70-72. Ladies, Tubs and the Greek Dance.
35. TAPA 81 (1950) 78-88. "Limewood" Cinesias and the Dithyrambic Dance.
36. CB 27 (1950) 3-4. A Figure of the Tragic Dance.
37. AJP 72 (1951) 300-307. Περὶ Κόκκασα - Aristophanes, Knights, 697.
38. Studies Presented to David Moore Robinson, Volume I. (St. Louis, 1951) 23-50. The Dance in Ancient Crete.
39. TAPA 82 (1951) 62-70. Krêtikôs in the Greek Dance.



40. TAPA 85 (1954) 148-158. Phora, Schêma, Deixis in the Greek Dance.
41. CO 34 (1957) 54-55. "She Could Have Danced All Night."
42. Studies in Honor of Ullman, St. Louis University (1960) 12-16. Cosmic Dance and Dithyramb.
43. Dance Perspectives 13 (Winter 1962). Terpsichore - The Story of Dance in Ancient Greece.
44. The Dance of the Ancient Greek Theatre (Iowa 1964).
45. The Dance in Ancient Greece (London 1964).

#### ADDENDA

These are articles listed in L'Annee philologique but not referred to by Lawler in her four major publications. Although not qualifying, as it were, for the Select Bibliography, each of these adds its crystal to the understanding of Greek dance.

An abbreviations list for journals may be found at the head of the Select Bibliography.

- A1. CJ XXIII (1927) 7-15. The Easter Dances at Megara.
- A2. CJ XLII (1947) 343-349. The Dance in Ancient Greece.
- A3. AJP 69 (1948) 87-91. Two Notes on the Greek Dance: (I) The Fox, (II) Pouring Out the Barley.
- A4. CJ XLVI (1951) 383-391. The Dance in Metaphor.
- A5. CJ XLVII (1952) 317-324. Dancing Herds of Animals.
- A6. CJ XLIX (1953-1954) 64-65. The Sports Page and the Ancient Greek Dance.
- A7. CW XLVII (1954) 102-106. Bee Dances and the Sacred Bee.
- A8. CJ LIX (1963) 1-7. The Dance in Fest.
- A9. CJ LX (1965) 267. Are they dancing?

Athens, National Museum (with permission)

Ἰσχυροτάτην τὴν χοροῦν ἐπιπέσει τὸν ἀντιπρόσωπον αὐτῆς

The 8th century B.C. inscription referred to in Lawler: 'A Dancer's Trophy' (p29). Lawler gives as its translation: "Whoever of all the dancers dances most spiritedly, let him receive this."